Presented by: The Manager Presented: 03/14/2022 Drafted by: R. Palmer III

RESOLUTION OF THE CITY AND BOROUGH OF JUNEAU, ALASKA

Serial No. 2979

A Resolution Authorizing the Manager to Amend the CLIA Settlement Agreement.

WHEREAS, Resolution 2852 (March 22, 2019) authorized the Manager to execute a settlement agreement to resolve the litigation related to the legality of the collection and expenditure of fees imposed upon a vessel related to the provision of municipal services and the construction of capital improvements; and

WHEREAS, paragraphs 3(d) and 7 of the settlement agreement encourage the parties to annually consult to discuss any new proposed projects and services for which CBJ passenger fees are sought to be expended; and

WHEREAS, the amendments authorized by this resolution would update information and clarify that CLIA is waiving objection to the expenditure of up to \$10 million in passenger fees for support to the Capital Civic Center project.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE ASSEMBLY OF THE CITY AND BOROUGH OF JUNEAU, ALASKA:

Section 1. Authorization. The Manager may execute the amended settlement agreement in substantially the same form as attached in Exhibit A.

Section 2. **Effective Date.** This resolution shall be effective immediately after its adoption.

Adopted this 14th day of March, 2022.

Attest:

eputy Mayor

Municipal Clerk

1 2 3

11 12

24

36

MEMORANDUM OF AGREEMENT (AMENDMENT 1)

This Memorandum of Agreement (hereinafter, the "Agreement") is made and entered into effective as of March_2019, by and between Cruise Lines International Association Alaska and Cruise Lines International Association ("Plaintiffs or CLIA"), on the one hand and The City and Borough of Juneau, Alaska and Rorie Watt (hereinafter "CBJ" and "Watt" respectively and collectively "Defendants"), on the other hand (Plaintiffs and Defendants may sometimes be referred to hereinafter collectively as the "Parties," or any one of them individually, a "Party") and reflects amendments agreed to on March____, 2022, in accordance with Paragraph 3(d), below.

RECITALS

13 WHEREAS, on or about April 13, 2016, Plaintiff filed an action in the United A. States District Court for the District of Alaska entitled Cruise Lines International Association 14 15 Alaska and Cruise Lines International Association v. The City and Borough of Juneau, Alaska and Rorie Watt, bearing case number 1:16-cv-0008-HRH (the "Action"). In the Action, Plaintiffs 16 challenged two fees imposed on vessels by the CBJ (the Marine Passenger Fee (MPF) a \$5-per 17 passenger fee and the Port Development Fee (PDF) a \$3-per passenger fee, collectively referred 18 to as "Fees") that enter CBJ public or private docks, alleging the Fees were either facially 19 unconstitutional or being expended by CBJ in an unconstitutional manner. Defendants disputed 20 the Plaintiffs' claims made in the Action, and generally and specifically disputed that the Fees 21 22 were unconstitutional or unlawful, while asserting that CBJ's use of the Fees was proper in all 23 respects.

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs and Defendants filed cross motions for summary judgement 25 B. and Defendants filed a motion to determine the law of the case. After oral argument the United 26 27 States District Court Judge, Hon. H. Russel Holland, issued an Order on December 6, 2018 ("MSJ Order") holding the Fees are permissible under the Tonnage Clause ("Tonnage Clause") of the 28 29 United States Constitution and the Rivers and Harbors Appropriation Act of 1899 (RHAA) codified at 33 U.S.C. section 5; provided said Fees are used for services to a vessel or rendered to 30 facilitate the marine enterprise/operations of the vessel and not for services that only benefit 31 passengers. While Judge Holland's rulings clarified the law, they leave the parties discretion to 32 amicably apply the Court Rulings. Thereafter, on January 25, 2019, Judge Holland entered a Final 33 Judgement in the Action affirming the holding of the MSJ Order (MSJ Order and Final Judgement 34 35 collectively referred to as "Court Rulings").

WHEREAS, it is the desire of the Parties hereto to abide by this Agreement and 37 C. 38 resolve the Disputes raised by the Parties in the Action in a manner consistent with the terms of 39 the MSJ Order and in compliance with the Final Judgement, unless the underlying legal authority changes. The parties agree that amicable resolution of the issues is better than continued litigation. 40 41 This Agreement shall further set forth the terms and conditions of the Parties continuing relationship based on the terms of the MSJ Order and Final Judgment and under which Fees, if 42 any, will be collected and expended. The MSJ Order and Final Judgment shall be subject to the 43 good faith interpretation of the Parties for certain projects. The Parties wish to avoid the costs and 44 the expenditure of resources in pursuing and defending continued litigation pertaining to the 45 various claims and/or defenses raised in the Action. The Parties agree that the terms and conditions 46 set forth in this Agreement are intended to be fully enforceable. 47

48

49 D. WHEREAS, other communities in Southeast Alaska are concerned about the impact of the Court Rulings on their communities and have voluntarily offered the CBJ monetary 50 support to appeal the Court Rulings, and as such, any amicable resolution between CBJ and CLIA 51 must be practical, not harmful to other communities in Southeast, and should acknowledge each 52 community must exercise local control in its decision making because each community has unique 53 approaches and issues. The Parties also acknowledge that CBJ's Marine Passenger Fee and Port 54 55 Development Fee are fees imposed upon a vessel, and not fees imposed upon a passenger like the State Commercial Passenger Vessel excise tax (A.S. 43.52.200 et. seq). The Parties agree that the 56 State Commercial Passenger Vessel excise tax was not litigated or an issue in the Action. The 57 58 State of Alaska and a predecessor of CLIA settled a dispute involving the State Commercial Passenger Vessel excise tax in 2010 resulting from No. 3:09-cv-00015-TMB, United States 59 District Court for the District of Alaska. 60

61

80

89

62 E. WHEREAS, CBJ acknowledges that the construction of the western seawalk project from Gold Creek to Overstreet Park may or may not have survived legal challenge and 63 that because CLIA chose not to seek an injunction for this part of the construction, this project 64 was not delayed and was successfully constructed; and while CLIA acknowledges that the western 65 seawalk project may or may not have survived a legal challenge, CLIA also acknowledges the 66 entire seawalk has been a part of CBJ's Long Range Waterfront Plan for more than 10 years, the 67 project has the support of the Juneau public and such public support is instrumental and necessary 68 to the development of the Juneau waterfront and the growth of the cruise industry. 69 70

71 F. WHEREAS, the Parties shall engage in annual meetings to discuss their respective issues and positions, regarding major development projects, as early as possible. For example, 72 during the 2019 consultations with the City Manager, CLIA did not object to the CBJ using fees, 73 74 subject to Assembly appropriation, imposed on a vessel or passenger to lease space away from the downtown Juneau area to temporarily stage containers during the cruise season to enable 75 vessels to efficiently unload, load, and timely depart instead of having containers trucked through 76 77 the Maritime Industry Zone during peak periods, and does not object to the use of an amount not to exceed \$10 million in fees over no longer than a five year period to support renovations/ 78 improvements/additions to the Capital Civic Center. 79

G. WHEREAS, the Parties affirm that nothing in this Agreement is an attempt to interfere with the Assembly's responsibility to govern the affairs of the City and Borough of Juneau but is provided to the Assembly as best practices pertaining to the collection and appropriation of Passenger fees so that future disputes may be avoided.

NOW, THEREFORE, for valid and binding consideration acknowledged by the Parties,
the Parties hereby agree as follows:

DEFINITIONS

A. The term "Cruise Lines International Association" shall include its Members calling in Juneau, Alaska, specifically and without limitation to include: Carnival Cruise Lines, Crystal Cruises, Disney Cruise Lines, Holland America Line, Norwegian Cruise Line, Oceana Cruises, Princess Cruises, Regent Seven Seas Cruises, Royal Caribbean International and Silverseas Cruises and any person or entity, past or present, acting on behalf of any of the foregoing, including, but not limited to, each of their present and former agents, representatives, owners, officers, executives, partners, directors, employees, insurers and/or attorneys.

2019 CLIA v. CBJ Settlement Agreement (Amendment 1)

97

B. The term "Cruise Lines International Association Alaska" (together with Cruise
Lines International Association, "CLIA") shall also include CLIA Northwest & Canada and any
person or entity, past or present, acting on behalf of any of the foregoing, including, but not
limited to, each of their present and former agents, representatives, owners, officers, executives,
partners, directors, employees, insurers and/or attorneys.

103 C. The term "The City and Borough of Juneau, Alaska" shall include any person or 104 entity, past or present, acting on its behalf, in the collection and expenditure of those certain Fees 105 collected from cruise vessels calling at the docks and local waters within the jurisdiction of CBJ, 106 including, but not limited to, each of their present and former members, representatives, officers, 107 executives, partners, directors, employees, insurers and/or attorneys, but not individual 108 Assemblymembers.

D. The term "Rorie Watt" shall include Mr. Watt in his official capacity as City Manager of Juneau, Alaska and any person or entity, past, present or future, acting in the official capacity as City Manager of Juneau, Alaska, including, but not limited to, each of their successors, assigns, representatives, officers, executives, partners, directors, employees, insurers and/or attorneys.

E. The term "Dispute(s)" shall be defined as all claims, defenses and/or allegations arising out of and in any way connected with the pleadings filed in the Action. The term shall not include future business dealings with respect to the collection and expenditure of Fees, except as otherwise agreed in this Agreement.

118F.The term "Marine Passenger Fee" ("MPF") shall mean that certain five U.S. dollar119(US\$5.00) per passenger fee assessed on certain passenger vessels as codified by CBJ Code120Sections 69.20.030 and 69.20.040.

G. The term "Port Development Fee" ("PDF") shall mean that certain three U.S.
dollar (US\$ 3.00) per passenger fee assessed on vessels carrying passengers for compensation on
port calls in the City and Borough of Juneau pursuant to Resolution 2552 (2010).

H. The term "Motion for Summary Judgment Order" ("MSJ Order") is defined
above. The terms of the MSJ are incorporated herein by this and any other reference. The MSJ
Order is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

I. The term "Final Judgment" refers to that certain Judgment In A Civil Case filed by the United States District Court Judge for the District of Alaska, Hon. H. Russel Holland, on January 25, 2019, and entered in the Action at Docket No. 217; the terms of which are incorporated herein by this and any other reference. The Final Judgment is attached hereto as Exhibit B.

I31 J. The term "Maritime Industry Zone" shall refer to that certain map attached heretoI32 as Exhibit D.

K. The term "Effective Date" shall be defined as the date of full execution of this
 Agreement by both parties.

136 137

AGREEMENTS

138 1. <u>Incorporation</u>. This Agreement hereby incorporates the Recitals and Definitions stated
 above.

- 140
- 141

142 2. Operational Services Budget. Attached as Exhibit C to this Agreement and incorporated herein by this reference is a true and correct copy of the CBJ FY 2019 Budgeted MPFs 143 expenditures. The Parties acknowledge the allocation of Fees stated therein and, for purposes of 144 this Agreement, CLIA does not object to each of the line item expenditures for FY 2019. With 145 respect to the allocation of Fees for General Government Services in the successive years 146 following FY 2019 governed by this Agreement, the Parties agree that in lieu of a line item 147 allocation for General Government Services, CBJ will obtain a cost allocation study of said 148 149 General Government Services and will allocate Fees based on the results of the future study effective FY2021 (July 1, 2020). The Parties understand and agree the intent of procuring an 150 151 audit under this paragraph is that the cost of operational services will not vary significantly (+/ten percent) from historical allocations for operational services. The parties agree that from time 152 to time inflationary adjustments will likely be necessary. 153 154 155 3. Agreed Use of Fees in Maritime Industry Zone. The Parties acknowledge and agree to the collection and expenditure of Fees in the Maritime Industry Zone. The Parties attach hereto as 156 Exhibit D an area map of downtown Juneau wherein CBJ provides (Zone A) or could provide 157 (Zone B) the infrastructure for cruise vessels, the support services for such vessels while in port, 158 and infrastructure and services that further the marine enterprise/operation of such vessels, 159 including: dockage, lightering, ship to shore infrastructure including utilities and debt service, 160 ship to ship infrastructure including debt service, seawalks, restrooms, signage/wayfinding, motor 161 coach staging, passenger queuing, terminal or emergency assembly facilities, access and parking 162 facilities for vehicles serving a vessel, and any infrastructure required or recommended by the 163 Department of Homeland Security (i.e. USCG and USCBP). The following expenditures are 164 agreed to by the Parties: 165 166 a. Debt service on the Cruise Ship Berth Enhancement project (commonly known as 167 16B) and the planning, design and construction necessary to improve private and public 168 cruise ship docks. The cost of acquiring land, tidelands, and easements required for the 169 construction of capital improvements would be considered eligible project costs. For 170 purposes of this Agreement, CLIA does not object to Fee expenditures for those 171 purposes. 172 173 174 **b.** For the purposes of this Agreement, CLIA does not object to Capital improvements within Zone A of the Maritime Industry Zone that further the marine enterprise/operation 175 of vessels as described above including: dockage, lightering, ship to shore infrastructure 176 including utilities and debt service, ship to ship infrastructure including debt service, 177 seawalks, restrooms, signage/wayfinding, motor coach staging, passenger queuing-178 179 facilities, access and parking facilities for vehicles serving a vessel, and any infrastructure required or recommended by the Department of Homeland Security (i.e. USCG and 180 USCBP). The Parties agree to the expenditure of Fees for this infrastructure in Zone A 181 182 and acknowledge that the CBJ may need to expand or change such services and infrastructure in Zone A due to a change in circumstances, such as changes in vessel size, 183 scheduling, and demands for such services or infrastructure by the changes in 184 185

circumstance. The cost of acquiring land, tidelands, and easements required for the construction of capital improvements would be considered eligible project costs. For purposes of this Agreement, CLIA does not object to Fee expenditures for those purposes.

186

187 188

189 c. Operational Services provided within Zone A pursuant to Paragraph 2, including but not limited to the following services that the CBJ provided in 2018 to CLIA, its 190 passengers or crew: dockage, lightering, restroom maintenance, crossing guards, 191 police/security patrols and infrastructure, fire and emergency medical service, weather 192 193 monitoring, tug assist, trash collection and disposal, and any service required or recommended by the Department of Homeland Security (i.e. USCG and USCBP). The 194 195 Parties agree to the expenditure of Fees for these services in Zone A and acknowledge that the CBJ may need to expand or change such services and infrastructure in Zone A 196 due to a change in circumstances, such as changes in vessel size, scheduling, and 197 198 demands for such services or infrastructure by the changes in circumstance. For purposes 199 of this Agreement, CLIA does not object to Fee expenditures for those purposes. 200

201**d.** For proposed capital improvements or operational services within Zone B, the parties202agree to discuss these ideas at the annual meeting. CLIA does not object to a Fee203expenditure in Zone B of an amount not to exceed \$10 million (\$10,000,000), over no204longer than a five year period, for the Centennial Hall Expansion Project (also known as205the "Capital Civic Center").

e. The Parties agree that expenditure of Fees outside of Zones A and B may be necessary. In such case, the parties shall discuss such ideas in accordance with paragraph 7.

211 4. Statter Harbor Improvement Project. CBJ has developed construction plans for improvements to Statter Harbor that will promote marine commerce in the area and provide 212 services to vessels. CLIA contends the full scope of construction of the Statter Harbor Project 213 may be beyond the scope of permissible expenditure of Fees set forth in the MSJ Order, but for 214 215 purposes of this Agreement, CLIA does not object to a Fee expenditure up to seventy-five percent (75%) of a total project budget not to exceed twelve million four hundred thousand 216 dollars (US\$12,400,000.) CBJ agrees to finance the remainder of the Statter Harbor Project 217 218 construction through other funding sources.

219

206 207

208 209

210

220 5. Attorney's Fees. Both Parties shall be reimbursed for their respective attorney's fees incurred litigating the Disputes brought in the Action. The Parties agree that CBJ shall cause one million 221 five hundred thousand dollars (\$1,500,000) to be paid from the MPF collected from CLIA 222 Members to partially reimburse CLIA for its attorney's fees incurred in the Action. The Parties 223 acknowledge that CBJ incurred approximately Eight Hundred Thousand (\$800,000) in legal fees 224 225 defending the Action and prior to the Effective Date of this Agreement has used approximately 226 Three Hundred and Fifty Thousand Dollars (\$350,000) from MPF collected from CLIA Members. The Parties agree that CBJ may cause the remaining Four Hundred and Fifty 227 Thousand Dollars (\$450,000) to be paid from the MPF collected from CLIA Members and use 228 229 those funds as an "other funding source" in accordance with paragraph 5. Payment to CLIA shall be made on or shortly after March 22, 2019. The Parties acknowledge that the CBJ has initially 230 provided the \$1.95M payments from FY2019 general funds (Ord. 2018-11(AF)); For purposes of 231 this Agreement, CLIA does not object to the CBJ reimbursing the \$1.95M payments of general 232 funds with FY20 MPF funds (Ord. 2019-14). Neither payment shall be deemed or constitute an 233 234 admission of liability or wrongdoing by either Party nor shall either Party be considered the 235 prevailing party.

2019 CLIA v. CBJ Settlement Agreement (Amendment 1)

236

6. <u>Public Records</u>. CBJ shall keep true and accurate records, sufficient to determine the amount
of Fees collected and the appropriation, allocation and expenditure of said Fees during any Fiscal
Year wherein Fees are collected from CLIA. Consistent with Alaska public records laws (e.g.
A.S. 40.25.110 and CBJC 01.70), these records shall be maintained and open to inspection
at CLIA's expense at reasonable intervals by an independent auditor during regular business
hours of CBJ. All audit expenses shall be considered costs recoverable to the prevailing party in
any dispute resolution initiated pursuant to Paragraph 9.

7. <u>Annual Consultation</u>. Guided by the timelines in CBJC 69.20.120(b) (March 14, 2019),
the Parties agree for each and every Fiscal Year, the Parties shall endeavor to meet in person
to discuss in good-faith any new proposed projects and services for which Fees are sought to
be expended in the following Fiscal Year with the ultimate decision resting with the Assembly.

8. <u>Amount of Fees</u>. CBJ acknowledges and agrees the MPF should remain at \$5.00 per passenger and the PDF should remain at \$3.00 per passenger for at least the next three years from the Effective date. However, if an Assembly determines otherwise during the next three years, the parties agree to meet and discuss consistent with paragraph 7. If there is any change to the State Commercial Passenger Vessel statutes (A.S. 43.52.200-295) during the three year period, then the intent of this section is null and void.

256

249

257 9. **Dispute Resolution**. In the event of any dispute, claim, question, or disagreement arising out of or relating to this Agreement or the annual project planning meeting or any breach thereof, 258 including any claims relating to collection and expenditure of the Fees, the Parties hereto shall 259 use their best efforts to settle such disputes, claims, questions or disagreements through direct 260 261 discussions and, if the matter cannot be settled through direct discussions, the parties agree to first endeavor to settle the dispute in an amicable manner by non-binding mediation, before 262 263 resorting to litigation. The parties agree that upon notice to the other demanding mediation, the statute of limitations for the matter is tolled. If the parties cannot reach a resolution through 264 mediation, then either party may file their claim in the United States District Court for the 265 District of Alaska, which shall be the sole and exclusive forum for resolving such matters. The 266 Parties agree that all claims shall be filed and adjudicated in the United States District Court for 267 the District of Alaska. The intent of this paragraph is to provide a process to resolve only 268 269 justiciable issues that the CBJ has undertaken or is reasonably certain to undertake with Fees; This paragraph is not intended to limit or compel the legislative discretion of the Assembly. 270

271

10. <u>Cost of Enforcement</u>. In the event that either party shall institute any action (whether
mediation and/or court litigation), at law or in equity, against the other party to enforce or
interpret any provision(s) of the this Agreement, or for breach hereof or default hereunder, the
prevailing party shall be entitled to reasonable legal fees and costs, and such other relief to which
it may be entitled, for the enforcement of any of its rights hereunder consistent with Alaska Civil
Rule 79 and 82.

- 278
 279 11. <u>Complete Agreement</u>. This <u>Amended Memorandum of Agreement represents the complete</u>
 280 and exclusive agreement by and between the Parties and supersedes all prior and
 - 281 contemporaneous promises and agreements of any kind relating to the resolution of the Disputes,

as well as all negotiations and discussions between the Parties hereto and/or their respective legal

- counsel with respect to the subject matters covered hereby. No other agreements, covenants,
- representations or warranties, express or implied, oral or written, have been made by any of the Parties hereto concerning the subject matter hereof. This is an integrated agreement.
- 285 286

12. <u>Term of Agreement</u>. The term of this Agreement shall be ten years from the effective date
with automatic ten year renewals unless either Party provides written notice to the other, sixty
days prior to the renewal date, to terminate this Agreement.

290

13. Successors and Assigns. All of the terms and provisions of the Agreement shall be binding
 upon and inure to the benefit of and be enforceable by the respective successors and assigns of the
 Parties.

294

14. <u>Governing Law.</u> This Agreement, the rights and obligations of the parties hereto, and any
claims or disputes relating thereto, shall be governed by and construed in accordance
with the laws of the United States of America and the State of Alaska.

298

15. Waiver of Breach. No waiver of any breach of any term or provision of this
Agreement shall be construed to be, or shall be, a waiver of any other breach of this
Agreement. No waiver shall be binding unless in writing and signed by the party waiving
the breach.

303

304 16. No Admission of Liability: The Parties agree that the execution of this Agreement is done solely for the purposes of compromise, and to eliminate the burden and expense of further 305 litigation, and does not constitute, and shall not be construed as, an admission of liability, 306 wrongdoing, fault or as evidence with respect thereto, by any Party, on account of any claims or 307 matters arising between CLIA on the one side and the CBJ on the other side raised in the Action. 308 The Parties further agree that this Agreement shall not be offered or received against any of the 309 310 Parties as evidence of a presumption, concession or admission with respect to any liability, fault 311 or wrongdoing, other than such proceedings as may be necessary to effectuate the terms of this Agreement, the MSJ Order and Final Judgment. The parties acknowledge and agree that nothing 312 in this Agreement is intended to prohibit disclosure by CLIA Members to their passengers and 313 guests of Fees paid to CBJ pursuant to this agreement or to prohibit CLIA Members from 314 continuing to assess passengers/guests for reimbursement of fees paid to CBJ. 315

Third party claims. In the event that a third-party files a claim or lawsuit against the CBJ
resulting from or related to this Agreement and/or the collection and expenditure of the Fees,
CLIA shall have no obligation to defend or indemnify the CBJ for such claim and/or lawsuit.
CLIA's agreements and/or cooperation with respect to the CBJ's collection and expenditure of
Fees, does not bind the CBJ in any manner to collect and expend the Fees nor does CLIA have
any responsibility for the expenditure of the Fees once the Fees are collected from CLIA
Members.

323

- 18. <u>Notice</u>. Any notice required to be given pursuant to this Agreement shall be deemed to have
- been sufficiently given either when served personally or when served by first-class mail
- addressed to the other Parties.
- 328 a. Notice to CLIA shall be effective only when addressed to: PresidentChairman, CLIA Alaska 329 360 K Street Suite 300 330 Anchorage, AK 99501 331 332 333 with copy to: President, CLIA 334 335 1201 F Street NW Suite 250 336 Washington, DC 20004 337 338 b. Notice to CBJ shall be effective only when addressed to: 339 City and Borough of Juneau 340 c/o City Manager 341 155 S. Seward St 342 Juneau, AK 99801 343 344
- Mutual Drafters. All Parties have cooperated in the drafting and preparation of this
 Agreement. Hence, this Agreement shall not be construed against any party on the basis that
 the party was the drafter.
- 348
- 349 20. <u>Severability.</u> If any provision of this Agreement shall be held by any court of
 350 competent jurisdiction to be illegal, void or unenforceable, such provision shall be of no force
 351 and effect, but the illegality or unenforceability of such provision shall have no effect upon and
 352 shall not impair the enforceability of any other provision of this Agreement.
- 353 354

| IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the Parties hereto have ex | leculeu uns memoranuum (|
|---|--------------------------|
| Agreement (Amendment 1). | |
| Cruise Lines International Association Alaska | |
| By: | |
| Its: | |
| Dated: | |
| | |
| Cruise Lines International Association | |
| By: | |
| [ts: | |
| | |
| Dated: | |
| Dated: | |
| Dated: The City and Borough of Juneau | |
| | |
| The City and Borough of Juneau | |
| The City and Borough of Juneau By: | |
| The City and Borough of Juneau By: Its: | |
| The City and Borough of Juneau By: Its: | |
| The City and Borough of Juneau By: Its: Dated: | |